

REMARKS/ARGUMENTS

Claims 1, 3-6, 8-10, 16 and 17 are pending in this application. Claims 1, 3-6, 8-10, 16 and 17 have been rejected. Claims 2, 7, and 11-15 were previously cancelled. Claims 1, 6, 16, and 17 have been amended. Support for the amendments may be found at least on page 5, lines 20-21 and page 9, lines 9-10 of the Specification. No new matter has been added.

In view of foregoing amendments and following remarks, the Applicants request allowance of the Application.

CLAIMS 16 AND 17 DEFINE OVER SKINNER

Claim 16-17 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Skinner, "Enhancing an Open Source UML Editor by Context-Based Constraints for Components", Technical University of Berlin, pp. 1-121, 12-2001, (hereinafter "Skinner").

Representative claim 16 has been amended to develop further aspects of the present invention. Claim 16 recites in part:

at least one nested test case class defined for each of a plurality of operations, wherein the operation is characterized as having a beginning and an end, wherein each operation includes a collaborative behavior of each of the classes, and ***wherein said at least one nested test case class tests every permutation of the operation between the beginning and the end of the operation;***

The portions of Skinner cited in the Office Action generally discuss various aspects of Java implementations of object models and the testing of documents or metamodels conforming to these implementations. However, the portions of Skinner discussing object model test cases fail to disclose the testing of every permutation an operation may take between a beginning and an end. *See* Skinner, Sect. 10.4, pp. 75-76. Thus, Skinner does not anticipate claim 16. Claim 17 has been amended to recite a similar limitation, and for at least the same reason, also is not anticipated by Skinner. Accordingly, Applicants respectfully request that the rejection of claims 16 and 17 under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) be withdrawn.

CLAIMS 1, 3-6, AND 8-10 DEFINE OVER SKINNER IN VIEW OF ELBAUM

Claims 1, 3-6 and 8-10 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as being unpatentable over Skinner, "Enhancing an Open Source UML Editor by Context-Based Constraints for

Components", Technical University of Berlin, pp. 1-121, 12-2001, in view of Elbaum, "Test Case Prioritization: A Family of Empirical Studies," IEEE, pp. 159-182, 2-2002, (hereinafter "Elbaum").

Independent claims 1 and 6 have been amended to recite in part "the test case class tests every permutation between the valid start states and the probable end states." As discussed above, the discussions of object model test cases in Skinner do not disclose test cases that test every permutation of an operation between a start state and a probable end state.

Elbaum, which generally discusses test case prioritization, does not cure the deficiencies of Skinner. Therefore, for at least all the same reasons discussed above, Applicants assert that claims 1, 3-6, and 8-10 are allowable over the combination of the Skinner and Elbaum, and respectfully request that the rejections under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) be withdrawn.

All outstanding rejections have been overcome. It is respectfully submitted that, in view of the foregoing amendments and remarks, the application is in clear condition for allowance. Issuance of a Notice of Allowance is earnestly solicited.

The Office is hereby authorized to charge any additional fees required under 37 C.F.R. § 1.16 or § 1.17 or credit any overpayments to Deposit Account No. **11-0600**.

The Office is invited to contact the undersigned at (408) 975-7500 to discuss any matter regarding this application.

Respectfully submitted,

KENYON & KENYON LLP

Date: September 5, 2008

/Mark D. Yuan/

Mark D. Yuan
(Registration No. 57,312)

Kenyon & Kenyon LLP
333 West San Carlos Street, Suite 600
San Jose, CA 95110

Telephone: (408) 975-7500
Facsimile: (408) 975-7501